INVESTIGATION INTO
MV ‘LADY JANE’ INCIDENT
HOBART
21/09/2013
# Table of Contents

Summary of incident 3
Preparation of Report 3
Sources of Information 3
Vessel Details, Tide, Weather, Mooring pontoon 4
Master and crew qualifications 5
Details of findings from interviews 6-8
Inspection of MV Lady Jane’s Safety Management Manual 8
Conclusion 9
Comments 10
Recommendations 11
Author Details 11
Records of Emergency Preparedness Training x 2 (Copies) 12-13
Operational Checklists x3 (Copies) 14-16
Logbook page day of incident (copy) 17
Images x 6 18-22
Summary of Incident

21/9/2013

Passenger vessel ‘Lady Jane’ was returning to the Tasports ferry pontoon berth (Franklin Wharf) at around 1600hrs after harbour cruise of one hour. During the berthing procedure the crew member on board was placing the eye (working end) of the mooring line (spring) onto the vessel’s starboard amidships cleat when the crewmember’s fingers became caught between the eye and the cleat. The other end of the line was secured to the pontoon bollard. The forward movement of the vessel was checked when the load came on the line causing two fingers of the crewmember’s right hand to be crushed between the rope and the cleat. One finger was severed and the other near severed. The injured crewmember received first aid from other passengers, an ambulance was called and the crewmember taken to hospital for medical treatment.

Preparation of Report

Interviews were conducted. All interviewees co-operated fully and answered all questions and requests consistent with what they believed happened on the day of the incident.

Sources of information

Master – Interview & Incident Report

Injured crewmember – Interview

Witness - Interview

Passenger / Witness – Written statement and telephone

Owner as reported by Master – Master’s wife was not available, now living in Philippines. Master states he has General Enduring Power of Attorney for Master’s wife.
Vessel Details:

Name: MV Lady Jane

Passenger Class 1E

Registration number 000268 (in current survey)

Owner: Master’s wife

(name and address removed for publication)

Vessel Length: 19.96M

Vessel Beam: 5.49M

Draft 2.74M

Displacement: 80 tonnes

Engine Power: 114.75 KW 6L3 Gardner Diesel

Year Built: 1974

Hull Material: Ferro Cement

Superstructure Material: Timber

Operational Limits: Class 1E. Within the waters of Port Hobart but not to seaward of an imaginary line drawn from Cape Direction to Kelly’s Point and another such line drawn from Scott Point to Hopwood Point

Minimum Manning Requirements: Master>24M (Master Class 5) Marine Engine Driver Grade 3, (Master may hold Marine Engine Driver Grade 3 certificate) Plus 1 General Purpose Hand (Deckhand)

Tide: Low tide Hobart 1618 (EST), Height 0.54 Metres

Sunrise/sunset: Rise 0602hrs Set 1806 (EST)

Weather conditions: Calm

Mooring position: Franklin Wharf Ferry Pontoon
Qualifications

Master: (Name and DOB removed)

Certificates of Competencies held:

Master<24M (Master Class 5) Restricted,


Restriction: Within the waters of the Port of Hobart but not to seaward of an imaginary line drawn from Blinking Billy Point to Tranmere Point

Marine Engine Driver Grade 3,


General Purpose Hand: (name and DOB removed)

Marine Qualifications: Nil
Details of findings from interviews

Master / Owner’s representative: 29/10/2013, 1500 hrs.

Master stated he was the master on MV Lady Jane on the day of the incident. Whilst berthing at the Franklin Wharf ferry pontoon at 1600hrs, he came into the berth starboard side to and let the vessel drift out of gear into a position where the deckhand could receive the mooring line from a boy standing on the pontoon and place the eye of the line on the starboard amidships cleat. The deckhand called out ‘got it’, the vessel continued slowly forward until the line was tight. Master heard a cry; a passenger called up the stairs that the deckhand had jammed her hand. He saw the deckhand and the passenger come inside he then put the vessel into ahead gear. He then cleared the passengers standing on the stairs and made his way down and put out the gangway to unload passengers. The boy on the pontoon had called triple zero for the ambulance and Master tied up the vessel securely and also called the ambulance to confirm they were coming.

Master stated that the deckhand normally picked the eye of the line off the pontoon with a boat hook and placed it on the vessels cleat, the other end was secured to a bollard on the pontoon. Normal loading and unloading of passengers is done with the vessel in ahead gear and the mooring line holding the vessel in position. Another line used at the bow if the wind was blowing the vessel away from the pontoon.

Master was asked if he knew of a previous incident in March 2010 when a crewmember was injured whist berthing using the same cleat, resulting in fingers being crushed. Master acknowledged he had heard about it. The vessel involved in that particular incident was the same vessel (Lady Jane) then named Commodore 1 under previous ownership.

The recommendation from the report of that incident was that the fixed eye placement onto the cleat be changed.

Master stated he had 30 years experience as master of his many vessels with no injuries. He also stated he had consumed no alcohol and taken no illicit drugs.

When asked if he could provide access to the vessel’s records i.e. Management Safety Manual and logbook he stated he could not, having recently sold the vessel. Master arranged with a former master of MV Lady Jane, (name removed) to help with this matter. Former master obliged.

Master had not taken charge of a vessel since the day of the incident at the time of the interview.
Interview: Deckhand / General Purpose hand

(Name removed) Interview 1/11/2013, 1300hrs

Crew member had been working for Master for approximately 6 years as a deckhand and hostess on his ferries; she had no formal qualifications and no in- house training throughout that period. Crew member states that on the day of the accident, the vessel was approaching the berth faster than usual and did not stop in a position to place the eye of the 6 metre mooring line over the starboard amidships cleat, as was the normal practice. Crew member was passed the eye of the line by a boy standing on the pontoon, namely (witness name removed). This action was not the norm as she usually picked up the line with a boathook. Crew member attempted to place the eye of the line over the cleat but only managed to partially do so, unfortunately crushing 2 fingers between the eye of the line and the cleat as the forward movement of the vessel came to a halt. The right index finger was severed at the top joint and the right middle finger severed just below the top joint. Passengers on board gave assistance wrapping her hand with scarfs, an ambulance was called and crew member taken to hospital.

Crew member stated that prior to the current method of holding the vessel with a fixed spring, the berthing was done with a running line. She told the owner that the fixed line wasn’t as safe as the running line.

Crew member claims that witness did not distract her in any way.

Witness interview 1/11/2013 1700hrs

(Name and DOB removed)

Witness was standing at the near end of the pontoon as Lady Jane approached the berth; he had been helping with his grandfather’s vessel (SV Preana) that operated on the other side of the pontoon. At about 7 metres away he asked crew member if she would like him to pass the rope, to which she replied yes and crew member took the rope by hand. Witness witnessed the incident and called the ambulance.
(Name removed) (Passenger)

Summary of written statement and phone conversation

When MV Lady Jane was coming into berth Passenger and her mother were standing by the disembarkation gate, they were asked to move by crew member so she had clear access to the area around the starboard-mooring cleat. When coming alongside the boat hit the wharf a few times, the boy on the wharf passed the rope to crew member and she knelt down and tried to attach the rope on the cleat. The boat hit the wharf again and crew member’s hand was stuck between the cleat and the rope, tearing off her index finger and almost severing her middle finger. Passenger bandaged the injured hand with scarfs and kept crew member’s hand elevated, she also retrieved the separated finger. She stated that crew member was shaking uncontrollably and in terrible pain and that the master did not appear at the scene until approximately 8 minutes after berthing. Passenger stated she felt it was an accident waiting to happen due to inadequate and poor safety precautions and that there was a reluctance of the skipper to assist with the injured crewmember. The first aid was left to Passenger, other passengers and the boy on the wharf who called the ambulance.”

Inspection of MV Lady Jane Safety Management Manual and logbooks

The record keeping on MV Lady Jane showed the logbooks had very little structure and detail, the Safety Management Manual was there in its basic form, compliance forms and recordings of some inductions, crew details and crew training are either loose leaflets and in most cases incomplete or non existent.

No induction form for crew member.

The only training reference to crew member are unsigned entries in copies of 2 Record of Emergency Preparedness Training forms see pages 12 & 13 The forms list crew member as having done training on 29/01/12, 28/04/12 and 30/11/12 (crew member stated she has never done any training).

Copy of logbook entry for 21/9/2013 the day of the incident see page 17
Conclusion

Mooring method: Using the working end fixed eye to cleat method of mooring is a danger when using short spring lines, the time taken to retrieve the line from the pontoon and the forward motion of the vessel taking up the slack is too short. If the vessel had been brought to a stop to allow more time for the deck hand to secure the line as is usually done the injury may not have happened. The inaccessibility of the starboard amidships cleat compounded the issue for a quick placement of the line over the cleat.

The vessel’s speed and impacting on the mooring piles whilst coming alongside the pontoon would have created an urgency for the line to be placed on the cleat resulting in fingers being caught between the cleat and the eye of the line.

The eye end of the 6 metre line was passed to crew member when the starboard amidships cleat was abeam of the pontoon bollard. This allowed only a short period for the spring line to be placed on the cleat as the vessel travelled forward.

Time to travel 6 metres:

1 knot = 11.67 seconds
0.5 Knot = 23.34 seconds

Crew member’s statement to the owner that fixed eye berthing was less safe should have alerted the owner to the potential hazard.

Training and Qualifications

Whilst crew member had worked with master for 6 years, she had no formal qualifications. Crew member stated she had not received any crew induction, and there is no evidence to suggest otherwise.

There is insufficient and incomplete documentation regarding records of crew training. See pages 12 & 13 Operational checklist and pages 14, 15 & 16 Record of emergency preparedness training.
Comments

The Master’s Master 5 Certificate of Competency expired 29/08/2013, 22 days before the incident; he was mailed a renewal notice dated 20/05/2013. At the time of the incident he was not qualified to operate as Master on a domestic commercial vessel.

The Master’s Marine Engine Driver Grade 3 Certificate of Competency expired 29/08/2013, 22 days before the incident; he was mailed a renewal notice dated 20/05/2013. At the time of the incident he was not qualified to operate as engineer on a domestic commercial vessel.

The Master, in all probability has contravened Marine Safety (Domestic Commercial Vessel) National Law Act 2012, Schedule 1, Part 4, Division 4, Certificates of Competency and Part 3, Division 3, Duties of Masters.

Owner, (name removed) in all probability has contravened Marine Safety (Domestic Commercial Vessel) National Law Act 2012, Part 3, Division1, Duties of Owners and Part 4, Division 4, Certificates of Competency
Recommendations

That emergency and general crew training drills be actually practiced on a regular basis, recording the type of training done, with participants names, signatures, dates and filed into the vessel’s Safety Management Manual as per Marine Safety (Domestic Commercial Vessel) National Law Act 2012, Schedule 1, Part 3, Division 3 Duties of Masters and Schedule 1, Part 3, Division 1 – Duties of Owners

That the Safety Management Manual has details filed of Masters and Crew, their qualifications, signed Induction forms by inductor and inductee showing all the items covered with induction and each item initialled as per Marine Safety (Domestic Commercial Vessel) National Law Act 2012, Schedule 1, Part 3, Division 3 - Duties of Masters and Schedule 1, Part 3, Division 1 – Duties of Owners

That use of a forward spring line with spliced eye (working end) cease.

Existing mooring cleats port and starboard to be replaced with a set of mooring bits or similar to page 22 and positioned to give unimpeded access for placement of a line.

A Job Safety Analysis of mooring procedure be conducted, resulting in a mooring procedure developed which mitigates risks and addresses shortcomings. The analysis should cover:

- Training
- Communication equipment and training in the use of.
- Modifications/installations.
- Safe working procedures.

That intercom or hand held radios be the method of good communication between wheelhouse and the crew’s mooring position.

A closed circuit television with wheelhouse display and camera pointed at the crew’s mooring positions is considered.

Author Details

Incident Report prepared by Rob Cassidy contains all relevant available information gathered and no responsibility can be taken for misinformation given or information withheld by others.

Rob Cassidy has been associated with recreational and commercial boating for over 50 years. Junior dinghy sailing at the age of 11 through to owning and skippering ocean racing/cruising yachts and commercial cruise vessels and has also served at sea as ships engineer.

Lecturer at the Australian Maritime College, Current Qualifications: Master class 5, MED1
# Appendix 2

## RECORD OF EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS TRAINING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Type of Training</th>
<th>Signature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2-9-17</td>
<td>P. O'Reilly</td>
<td>M.C.E.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S. Smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M. J. Evans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-27-16</td>
<td>M. J. Evans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S. Smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-9-17</td>
<td>R. D.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M. J. Evans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-27-16</td>
<td>M. J. Evans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S. Smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14-6-12</td>
<td>P. O'Reilly</td>
<td>M.C.E.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P. V.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M. J. Evans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28-7-12</td>
<td>P. O'Reilly</td>
<td>M.C.E.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P. V.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-8-12</td>
<td>P. O'Reilly</td>
<td>M.C.E.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S. Smith</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M. J. Evans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Appendix 2

## RECORD OF EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS TRAINING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Type of Training</th>
<th>Signature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-9-12</td>
<td>All Staff</td>
<td>Causing Supervision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24-10-12</td>
<td>P. O’Mara</td>
<td>P. Osiris</td>
<td>Convoy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-11-12</td>
<td>P. O’Mara</td>
<td>M. M. R.</td>
<td>J. A.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-12-12</td>
<td>P. O’Mara</td>
<td>M. M. R.</td>
<td>S. O. W.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-1-13</td>
<td>All Staff</td>
<td>Incident of</td>
<td>P. A. P.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
OPERATIONAL CHECKLIST

Instructions for using the Operational Checklist:

Owner to confirm that the operation of the vessel complies with each item in the following table by signing in the appropriate right hand column at the end of month 3, 6, 9 and 12 after the annual survey.

This checklist is a guide and can be modified as required to reflect an owner’s requirements. The Operational Checklist and supporting documentation shall be provided to the Authority or auditor upon request.

Vessel Name: LADY JANE  Owner: M.S. FANTOS
Period: From: 1/1/13 to: 7/1/13

Section 1 – Emergency preparation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emergency preparation</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Months (initial)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Muster stations</td>
<td>There is a process for checking that all people onboard can be accounted for and realise for further emergency actions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Person overboard</td>
<td>Crew are practised at recovering a person from the water.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>There is an organised response to a fire in any area of the vessel.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collision/grounding</td>
<td>There is an organised response for actions following a collision or grounding.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flood</td>
<td>Crew are practised at response to a flood situation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abandon ship</td>
<td>There is an organized response to a decision to evacuate the vessel.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Severe weather</td>
<td>There is a plan to secure the vessel in the event of severe weather.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical emergency / serious injury</td>
<td>There is a plan to provide medical assistance, obtain expert advice and provide evacuation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Version 1.00 07 OCT 2010
### Section 2—Seamaanship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Seamaanship</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Jan</th>
<th>April</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>Sept</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preparing for sea</td>
<td>The readiness of the vessel, crew and the suitability of the weather are systematically checked prior to commencing operation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watchkeeping</td>
<td>Manning and layout arrangements allow a safe watch to be kept at all times.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>The communications equipment is adequate, is in good order and working. It is regularly tested.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navigation</td>
<td>Navigation equipment is adequate, is in good order and watchkeepers are competent with its use. It is regularly tested.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search and rescue</td>
<td>Crew are trained in carrying out their duties should the vessel be involved in a search and rescue incident.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restricted visibility</td>
<td>The vessel crew are trained and practised at operating the vessel in restricted visibility.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management of watertight integrity</td>
<td>Arrangements to prevent uncontrolled flooding are understood by each crew member.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dangerous goods and hazardous materials</td>
<td>The carriage of dangerous goods and hazardous materials is managed to minimise risk to the people, vessel or the environment.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manoeuvring and steering</td>
<td>Crew are practised at alternative steering arrangements.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mooring</td>
<td>Crew are practised at mooring the vessel.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anchoring</td>
<td>Crew are practised at anchoring the vessel.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towing</td>
<td>The crew are practised at rigging a tow.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transferring people in and from the vessel</td>
<td>Each crew member is practised at transferring people in and from the vessel.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Working with lines | All crew understand the dangers and know how to work with lines under strain.
---|---
Passenger safety briefing | Passengers are provided with safety information to enable them to minimise their exposure to risk.
Working with fishing equipment | All crew understand the dangers and know how to work with the vessel’s fishing equipment.

### Section 3 – Machinery and maintenance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Machinery and maintenance</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Months (Initial)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Operating plant and machinery</td>
<td>Crew are trained in the safe use of all plant and machinery as appropriate to their duties.</td>
<td>Jan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refuelling</td>
<td>Any risk of pollution is minimised while refuelling.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pumping of bilges</td>
<td>Arrangements permit the bilges to be kept clean and oil free to prevent the discharge of oil overboard.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance of the vessel, its plant and machinery</td>
<td>There is a regular system of maintenance to ensure the vessel, and all plant and machinery is in safe working order.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Section 4 – Environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environment</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Months (Initial)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disposal of garbage</td>
<td>Garbage is routinely disposed of ashore as required by law.</td>
<td>Jan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disposal of waste oil</td>
<td>Waste oil is routinely disposed of ashore as required by law.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Logbook entry 21/09/2013
Starboard amidships cleat

Note limited access
Limited access on outboard side of cleat

Simulation of spring line as usually positioned over cleat
Simulation of spring line partly over cleat and entrapped fingers
Franklin Wharf
Ferry pontoon Berth

Pontoon end of spring line attached to this cleat
Arrow indicates position of new Franklin Wharf
Ferry Pontoon and the Lady Jane berth

Recommended style of mooring bits.

livart@livartmarina.com